

Proof of Value Review™ Rubric

Competency-based review guide for faculty · The Proof Lab™

Competency	Exceptional	Strong	Developing	Emerging
Problem Framing <i>Does the student clearly define the real business problem?</i>	Reframes the challenge with unusual clarity; identifies the underlying problem, not just the symptom.	Defines the problem accurately and sets a sensible scope.	States the problem, but stays close to the brief without interpretation.	Problem is unclear, overly broad, or restated from the brief.
Research & Insights <i>Is the thinking grounded in credible evidence?</i>	Draws on varied, credible sources and surfaces a genuinely non-obvious insight.	Uses relevant sources well and connects findings to the problem.	Some research present; connection to the problem is partial.	Little evidence, or sources are not connected to the argument.
Critical Thinking <i>Is the analysis logical, structured, and honest about tradeoffs?</i>	Rigorous, well-structured analysis that tests assumptions and acknowledges tension.	Sound reasoning with a clear logical thread.	Reasoning is present but uneven or asserted rather than shown.	Conclusions do not follow from the evidence presented.
Strategic Judgment <i>Are the recommendations realistic, prioritized, and defensible?</i>	Recommendations are prioritized, feasible, and clearly tied to impact and constraints.	Practical recommendations supported by the analysis.	Recommendations are reasonable but generic or unprioritized.	Recommendations are vague, unsupported, or impractical.
Communication <i>Could this be presented to a leadership team as-is?</i>	Executive-ready: clear narrative, confident structure, nothing wasted.	Clear, professional, and easy to follow.	Understandable, but structure or clarity needs work.	Hard to follow; key points are buried or missing.

How to use this rubric

Read the submission once end to end before scoring. Choose the level that best describes the work as a whole for each competency — there are no numeric scores and no averaging. A student may be Exceptional in one competency and Developing in another; that contrast is the most useful feedback you can give.

Comments are optional but valuable. One specific sentence per competency is worth more than a paragraph of general praise. Review should take under five minutes.

Reviewer Worksheet

Print or annotate while reviewing a single submission

Student _____ Course _____

Challenge _____

Problem Framing

Does the student clearly define the real business problem?

☐ Exceptional ☐ Strong ☐ Developing ☐ Emerging

Comment (optional) _____

Research & Insights

Is the thinking grounded in credible evidence?

☐ Exceptional ☐ Strong ☐ Developing ☐ Emerging

Comment (optional) _____

Critical Thinking

Is the analysis logical, structured, and honest about tradeoffs?

☐ Exceptional ☐ Strong ☐ Developing ☐ Emerging

Comment (optional) _____

Strategic Judgment

Are the recommendations realistic, prioritized, and defensible?

☐ Exceptional ☐ Strong ☐ Developing ☐ Emerging

Comment (optional) _____

Communication

Could this be presented to a leadership team as-is?

☐ Exceptional ☐ Strong ☐ Developing ☐ Emerging

Comment (optional) _____